



Payday, Ponchos, or Promotions?

Remuneration and Incentives for Community Health Workers

What is your organization's experience?
A short survey proposition.



McGill



Humanitarian Studies

Marie-Renée B-Lajoie, MDCM and Jennifer Hulme, MPH
CORE Group Webinar December 13th, 2011

Plan

- Video
- Introduction
- Background Evidence
- Survey
- Discussion



Video

- <http://youtu.be/u6XAPnuFjJc>



For more details on Drive

VHWs and Motivation Psychology, narrated presentation presented at APHA Community-based Primary Health Care Conference in November 2011:

www.caregroupinfo.org/vids/CHW_Motivation/CHW_Motivation.html

Care Groups and Volunteer Motivation, narrated presentation presented at APHA Community-based Primary Health Care Conference in November 2011:

www.caregroupinfo.org/vids/CGMotivation/CGMotivation.html

What motivates us?

Mechanical skills

Performance =



Cognitive skills

Performance \neq



What motivates us?

Once money is off the table:

+ Autonomy
Mastery
Purpose



Community Health Workers

Some algorithmic work

But much more than



And other motivators ...



Motivators

PURPOSE

STATUS

JUSTICE

SUPERVISION

...



Background



BASICS II

Community Health Worker Incentives and Disincentives: How They Affect Motivation, Retention, and Sustainability



Contributors

Karabi Bhattacharyya

Karen LeBan

Peter Winch

Marie Tien

Background

CHW Incentives and Disincentives by a Systems approach



Autonomy,
Mastery &
Purpose

CHWs: Incentives & Disincentives

- ✓ Relationship with community
- ✓ MIX intrinsic & extrinsic
- ✓ Vary incentives based on CHW duties. CHWs need to be recognized as volunteers even if they receive small cash incentives
- ✓ Need to understand why are CHWs dropping out?
- ✓ More research on financing schemes & retention/attrition is needed

Bhattacharyya et al. 2001 CHWs: Incentives & Disincentives



The Policy Discourse = EVOLVING !

Community Health
Framework For

- “Honouring these valued community volunteers is important. Some form of incentive (such as honorarium, in-kind payment, uniform, badges or T-shirts) is therefore important.

- **The choice of incentives depends on the wishes of the community and the financial status of the CHBC programme.**

2002

Task shifting: rational redistribution of tasks among health workforce teams. Geneva:

- Recommendation 14: Countries should recognize that essential health services cannot be provided by people working on a voluntary basis if they are to be sustainable. While volunteers can make a valuable contribution on a short term or part time basis, trained health workers who are providing essential health services, including community health workers,

- **[...] should receive adequate wages and/or other appropriate and commensurate incentives.**

2007

Scaling up, saving lives. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2008.

- “There is virtually no evidence that volunteerism can be sustained for long periods”
- “...the burden of evidence indicates that stipends, travel allowances and other non-financial incentives are not enough to ensure the livelihood of health workers and that the absence of adequate wages will threaten the effectiveness and long-term sustainability of community health worker programmes.”

- “Trained health workers who are providing essential health services, including community health workers,

- **[...] should receive adequate wages and/or other appropriate and commensurate incentives”**

2008



WHO - Guidelines



Debates within Anthropology Literature

FEMALE COMMUNITY HEALTH VOLUNTEER PROGRAMME - NEPAL

- Regular wages :
 - **Financially unfeasible**
 - “**potential threat to the Volunteers’ social respect**, and thereby to their motivation”

The female community health volunteer programme in Nepal: Decision makers’ perceptions of volunteerism, payment and other incentives. Glenton, C. et al. Social Science & Medicine, 70(12), 1920-1927.

- Wages inappropriate = oversimplified + tenuous evidence
- Comment
 - Key informants interviewed in the Nepal Ministry of Health and Population (MoHP) were mostly “men in senior positions”

Critique of the Nepal FCHW Study: Culture, status and context in community health worker pay: Pitfalls and opportunities for policy research. A commentary on Glenton et al. (2010) K. C. Maes et al. Social Science & Medicine 71 (2010) 1375-1378.



Beyond 8 Hours a Week:

CHWs in the era of chronic disease and ARV expansion

- Winning Policy Change to Promote Community Health Workers: Lessons From Massachusetts in The Health Reform Era. Mason et al. American Journal of Public Health. 101(12): 2011.
- Why is paying poor people for their labour controversial?
The PIH Accompagnateur model: <http://www.pbs.org/now/shows/537/index.htm>
- Therapeutic Enclaves in Central Mozambique? Lives Saved, Livelihoods Lost.
Ippolytos Kalofonos
<http://somatosphere.net/2011/03/therapeutic-enclaves-in-central.html>
- NGO Code of Conduct
“NGOs commit to advocate for fair monetary compensation for work done by all employees, across the health care system, including salaries for community health workers.”
<http://ngocodeofconduct.org/code-articles/compensation-practices/>



Our survey

Document current practices in CHW programs

- Monetary & non-monetary incentives
- Relation to supervision, workload, attrition

<https://www.surveymonkey.com/s/CHW-Survey>

- Based on the population of iNGOs affiliated with the CORE group but not representative of ALL CHWs programs
 - = A sample of program experiences



Discussion points

- In your programs, what monetary and non monetary incentives have contributed to the success/good performance ?
- What monetary and non-monetary incentives have proven problematic or disincentivized CHW performance? Why do you think that was the case?
- What are the most important ethical and practical issues at play in your experience with deciding on CHW incentives and compensation?



Discussion points

- Are there national or institutional guidelines to help guide this process where you work? How has this been helpful or problematic?
- Have you operationalized a clear career path for CHWs (via educational and promotion opportunities) and what has been your experience with this?



Survey

Paper copy

OR

<https://www.surveymonkey.com/s/CHW-Survey>



Conclusion

- Complex subject
- Promote research
- Exchange experiences



Thank you ! Merci !

marie-renee.lajoie@mail.mcgill.ca

